

CONTENTS

A SURVEY ON THE GENERAL CONDITIONS OF WOMEN'S EMPLOYMENT IN TURKEY AFTER THE PRIME MINISTERIAL CIRCULAR NO.2010/14.....	2
PREFACE.....	2
INTRODUCTION.....	6
FINDINGS OF THE RESEARCH.....	13
1. POLICIES ON WOMEN'S EMPLOYMENT.....	14
a. Getting into Employment.....	14
b. Staying in Employment.....	19
c. Creating Employment.....	21
d. Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Board (İİMEK) meetings, participating in the meetings, meeting agendas.....	24
2. WOMEN'S LABOUR IN LOCAL AND CENTRAL POLICY TEXTS/DOCUMENTS.....	26
CONCLUSION.....	28
SUGGESTIONS.....	32
REFERENCE.....	33
APPENDICES.....	34
Appendix-1: The Prime Ministerial Circular No. 2010/4: Increasing Women's Employment and Achieving Equal Opportunity.....	34
Appendix-2: Projects and Protocols on Women's Labour.....	35
Appendix-3: Women's Labour and Employment in Turkey: Problem Areas and Policy Suggestions (KEİG Report, 2009).....	39
Appendix-4: Tables and Charts.....	39
Appendix-5: Questions:.....	43

A SURVEY ON THE GENERAL CONDITIONS OF WOMEN'S EMPLOYMENT IN TURKEY AFTER THE PRIME MINISTERIAL CIRCULAR NO.2010/14

Preface

In recent years, women's labour and employment have been made an issue of debate in its diverse dimensions- for various groups in Turkey. Besides women's movement and labour organizations, a wide range of actors from government institutions to employers and international organizations have been problematizing the low rate of women's employment and emphasized the necessity of increasing it, arguing from differing perspectives on the issue. The groups and actors which draw attention to the "low rate of women's employment" have different motivations in terms of their positions and priorities. On the other hand, some of these groups share common reasonings while dealing with the issue. They use common discourses and make common suggestions for solution. For instance, government officials and employers who evaluate the issue only from a quantitative perspective pay attention to the low rate of women's employment in Turkey only from a comparative perspective, comparing Turkey with the OECD and EU countries. From their perspective the low rate of women's employment is a major problem within the context of "social development", "human capital development" and EU harmonization policies ('low rate of women's employment' was brought up to Turkey's agenda in recent years also as a result of these policies). Their solution for this major problem has been to increase women's employment rate drawing on some policy tools; while they kept voiced that need to increase women's employment rate as a "contribution to the development of the country" and a measure to "prevent the waste of labour force."

On the other side, women participating in women's movement and labour organizations have been drawing attention to the importance of taking "quality" of women's employment into consideration, besides the quantity of it. In recent years, many policies and projects have been conducted with women's movement's efforts and in response to the needs of other actors. Similarly, Women's Labour and Employment Initiative (KEIG) Platform, has been working on the projects aiming to improve the visibility of women's labour and increase quality of quantity of women's employment to a level enabling decent life and decent work opportunities since 2006; and in parallel trying to play an active role in the determination of economic and social policies in the area using local and national mechanisms available.

However, despite all the efforts, it is not possible to claim that the policies and documents which were made to increase women's employment and to empower women in the economic area have reached their objectives. There are many reasons behind that failure, from the common mentality intrinsic to the policy making paradigm to the patriarchal-capitalist set of relationships entrenched at the material level. Many national and international documents and organization such as The Eighth

and Ninth Development Plans, Gender Equality Action Plans, Turkish National Assembly's Committee on Equality of Opportunity for Women and Men, International Labour Organization (ILO) agreements and European Union Harmonization Process programs are structured by an integrated approach that could influence various projects. However, all of these have had limited influences in practice. The Prime Ministerial Circular on "Increasing Women's Employment and Achieving Equal Opportunity" which was issued in 2010 introduced responsibility and duty of some institutions for taking measures towards gender equality. The goal of the Prime Ministerial Circular was defined as "strengthening women's socio-economic positions, achieving equality in social life between women and men, increasing women's employment in order to achieve sustainable economic growth and social development, and providing equal pay for equal work." The arrangements that the Circular promotes largely overlapped with the demands for which women's movement and KEIG as a component of it have been struggling for many years. However, the concrete arrangements that the Circular brings forth in text are not realized in practice. Moreover, it is reported that in many cases what appeared has been counter-practices of what the Circular measures set out. In the light of all these observations, KEIG Platform members agreed on the necessity of making a "needs analysis" in order to determine the methods through which women's organizations in the KEIG Platform can participate in local policy making processes, and to review the political demands according to the current state of women's employment in provinces. Hence the research named "General Conditions of Women's Employment in Turkey After the Prime Ministerial Circular" was conducted in 12 provinces (Adana, Ankara, Antalya, Çanakkale, Denizli, Diyarbakır, İstanbul, İzmir, Kocaeli, Şanlıurfa, Trabzon and Van) in which women's organizations participating in the KEIG Platform have offices. The research has been shaped as a needs analysis; and it aimed to investigate how the Circular was put into practice and where it channeled the policies and activities on women's employment.

First phase of the study starts with a critical examination of the policies, programmes and projects of the relevant institutions and bodies¹ active in the area of women's employment. Within this scope, their strategic plans, in-service training programs and other relevant documents were reviewed. Furthermore, as the authorized policy actors at the provincial level, Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards were put under examination making use of the documents those Boards prepared about their policies and activities. Study also intended to determine whether there was a childcare center in Organized Industrial Zones (OSB) or not; and around similar pursuits of investigation, researched the general state of women's employment at the provincial level. In the second phase of the research, a sum of 120 face to face interviews were conducted in June and July 2012 with the representatives from the state institutions, associations that the Circular assigned duty on -directly or indirectly-, women's groups within the Unions, women's organizations and from other prominent local organizations related to employment. Various

1 *Employment and Job Agency, Governorship, Municipality, Provincial Special Administration, Development Agency, KOSGEB (Small and Medium Enterprises Development Organization), Provincial Directorates of Family and Social Policy, Provincial Directorates for National Education, Public Education Centers, Chamber of Industry, Chamber of Trade, Provincial Council of Women Entrepreneurs in TOBB (Union of Chambers and Commodity Exchanges of Turkey) and etc.*

A SURVEY ON THE GENERAL CONDITIONS OF WOMEN'S EMPLOYMENT IN TURKEY AFTER THE PRIME MINISTERIAL CIRCULAR NO.2010/14

data have been obtained through those interviews. However, after the first series of interviews, the need for a deeper investigation about some bodies and projects such as the National Monitoring and Coordination Committee for Women's Employment was ascertained. In general, the lack of gender- disaggregated data, and monitoring and assessment results concerning the activities have been observed at every phase of the research. The first two phases of the research was finished by the meeting that was held on October 17, 2012. In this meeting a road map has been drawn through the processing of the data sets that the women's organizations gathered together, their observations during the process and the initial findings of the research. This mid-term assessment report consists of the data gathered through interviews that were conducted in various institutions and women organizations in 12 provinces and the evaluation of the texts and documents of the Circular. The research may be considered as a needs analysis. However, although the methodology has been determined in accordance with a needs analysis, the work has transformed into an action research due to adjustments made at the implementation phase. Women's organizations participating in the KEIG Platform visited the state institutions and establishments together and asked the officials questions that are related to 13 articles of the Circular. Particularly when the questions about directives which directly concerning women's organizations (the suggestion to collaborate with women's NGO's and the obligation to give seat to women's NGO representatives in provincial employment and vocational education committees) were directed to the officials by women from women's NGOs directly, the action research quality of the research manifested itself. During and after the interviews, there have been positive changes in the relationships of women's organizations' with the public, institutions nature of which had differed from weak to strong until then.

The research continues in its two path bifurcations. The influence that was created in the first two phases of the research by the local women's organizations continues to produces results which calls for further investigation; and the monitoring of national level the committees that has been formed in a higher and policy making scale and the particular projects continue to be essential concerns and activities of the research process. The report you are reading now is only a mid-term assessment of the first two phases of this research. A big amount of data sets on the direction of policies for increasing women's employment in 12 provinces was, though already obtained, not included in this mid-term report. Overall assessment will involve detailed information on the provinces together with the demographic, economic data and the tendencies peculiar to each province. This mid-term assessment aims to discuss the initial findings of the research. With this report, we hope to carry the local interactions that the research achieved to the national level through public involvement.

INTRODUCTION

According to the Turkish Statistical Institute's (TÜİK) July 2012 report, 30 per cent of the women in Turkey participate in the labour force, while 25 percent of women are employed. (TÜİK, Household Labour Force Survey, July 2012 Report).² According to the same report, 11 per cent of the women are unemployed and unemployment rate for women is higher than for men, especially in urban areas.

The table below shows the changes in women's employment between 1990 and 2011 on an annual basis in numbers and rates.

Table 1: Labour Force and Employment Rates for the Population Aged 15 and Above, Turkey (2011)

Year	Women				Men			
	Labour Force (000)	Labour Force Participation Rate (%)	Employed (000)	Employment Rate (%)	Labour Force (000)	Labour Force Participation Rate (%)	Employed (000)	Employment Rate (%)
1990	6,160	34,1	5,637	31,2	13,990	79,7	12,901	73,5
1995	6,427	30,9	5,958	28,7	15,858	77,8	14,628	71,7
2000	6,188	26,6	5,801	24,9	16,890	73,7	15,780	68,9
2001	6,451	27,1	5,969	25,1	17,040	72,9	15,555	66,5
2002	6,760	27,9	6,122	25,3	17,058	71,6	15,232	63,9
2003	6,555	26,6	5,891	23,9	17,086	70,4	15,256	62,9
2004	5,669	23,3	5,047	20,8	16,348	70,3	14,585	62,7
2005	5,750	23,3	5,108	20,7	16,704	70,6	14,959	63,2
2006	5,916	23,6	5,258	21,0	16,836	69,9	15,165	62,9
2007	6,016	23,6	5,356	21,0	17,098	69,8	15,382	62,7
2008	6,329	24,5	5,595	21,6	17,476	70,1	15,598	62,6
2009	6,851	26,0	5,871	22,3	17,898	70,5	15,406	60,7
2010	7,383	27,6	6,425	24,0	18,257	70,8	16,170	62,7
2011	7,859	28,8	6,973	25,6	18,867	71,7	17,137	65,1

Resource: Turkish Statistical Institute (TÜİK) Household Labour Force Survey, July 2011.

When women's labour force and employment rates are evaluated on regional basis³, stark differences between regions can be identified. The table below shows the distribution of women's employment according to the Level II territorial units (NUTS2).

² Additionally, women's employment and labour force participation rates are lower in urban areas compared to the rural areas. According to the labour force and employment statistics for the population aged 15 and above, there has been constant rise in women's labour force participation rate in urban areas from 2004 to 2011 (from 14% to 24,8 %). Although women's labour force participation rate in rural areas decreased between 2004-2008; after the economic crisis, it started to increase again, and reaching 37,5 % in 2011 exceeded the highest rate in 2004. Resource: Turkish Statistical Institute (TÜİK) Household Labour Force Survey, July 2011.

³ It is possible to reach regional data about women's labour force and employment; however there is no statistical data on provincial basis unless it was collected in scope of a private research. Only in the reports of

The provinces that are included in the survey are highlighted in the table.

Table 2: Labour Force and Employment Rates for the Women Population aged 15 and above in 2011, (Level 2) Turkey (2011)

		Labour force participation rate (%)	Unemployment rate (%)	Employment rate (%)
2011	TOTAL	28.8	11.3	25.6
1	TR10 (İstanbul)	25.2	15.2	21.4
	TR21 (Tekirdağ, Edirne, Kırklareli)	33.9	13.8	29.2
2	TR22 (Balıkesir, Çanakkale)	29.2	6.2	27.4
3	TR31 (İzmir)	33.9	21.1	26.7
	TR32 (Aydın, Denizli, Muğla)	37.8	10.5	33.9
	TR33 (Manisa, Afyon, Kütahya, Uşak)	33.4	4.9	31.8
	TR41 (Bursa, Eskişehir, Bilecik)	27.5	10.4	24.7
	TR42 (Kocaeli, Sakarya, Düzce, Bolu, Yalova)	34.0	15.2	28.8
	TR51 (Ankara)	25.6	12.3	22.5
	TR52 (Konya, Karaman)	26.7	8.8	24.4
	TR61 (Antalya, Isparta, Burdur)	40.5	11.4	35.9
	TR62 (Adana, Mersin)	31.4	13.7	27.1
	TR63 (Hatay, Kahramanmaraş, Osmaniye)	28.6	10.3	25.6
	TR71 (Kırıkkale, Aksaray, Niğde, Nevşehir, Kırşehir)	23.9	8.6	21.8
	TR72 (Kayseri, Sivas, Yozgat)	29.2	11.6	25.8
	TR81 (Zonguldak, Karabük, Bartın)	43.6	7.4	40.4
	TR82 (Kastamonu, Çankırı, Sinop)	45.8	6.4	42.8
	TR83 (Samsun, Tokat, Çorum, Amasya)	36.0	6.1	33.8
	TR90 (Trabzon, Ordu, Giresun, Rize, Artvin, Gümüşhane)	44.0	4.7	41.9
	TRA1 (Erzurum, Erzincan, Bayburt)	28.8	3.1	27.9
	TRA2 (Ağrı, Kars, Iğdır, Ardahan)	31.6	3.5	30.5
	TRB1 (Malatya, Elazığ, Bingöl, Tunceli)	25.4	9.9	22.8
	TRB2 (Van, Muş, Bitlis, Hakkari)	22.7	8.8	20.7
	TRC1 (Gaziantep, Adıyaman, Kilis)	14.2	12.3	12.4
	TRC2 (Şanlıurfa, Diyarbakır)	7.9	3.0	7.7
	TRC3 (Mardin, Batman, Şırnak, Siirt)	8.2	11.8	7.2

Resource: Turkish Statistical Institute (TÜİK) Household Labour Force Survey, July 2011.

Evaluation of the data given in the table reveals a common tendency especially relevant in metropolises and large provinces,. Women's unemployment rates seem higher in metropolises like İstanbul, İzmir, Ankara and in the large provinces such as Antalya, Adana, Samsun, Kayseri and Gaziantep.

When the sectoral distribution of women's employment is examined, "the horizontal segregation in labour market" appears to be quite high. Hence, the assumptions

some Development Agencies, there is detailed data on provincial basis. (For Example, "Women's Employment Research" that Dicle Development Agency conducted in the cities of Diyarbakır and Urfa). Although the Turkish Statistical Institute's province based data (until the year 2010) is available, the data is not gendered. Therefore it is difficult to make a reliable comparison between provinces that are included in the research.

INTRODUCTION

about “separation of women’s jobs and men’ jobs” causing women’s concentration in a number of sectors seems to be valid at this scale of examination. The sectors in which women are predominantly employed are the ones that are socially considered to be “appropriate fields for women”. Therefore, women are mostly employed in service sectors, labour-intensive processes of industrial manufacture and agricultural production.⁴

The table below shows that 42 per cent of women in labour force work in the agriculture, while 43 per cent in the service sector. (TÜİK, Household Labour Force Survey, July 2012). It can be located that although there is a rise in the number of women working in agriculture and industry in 2012, the shares of those sectors is in decrease. Also, the number of women working in the construction sector seems to have increased as this sector has been growing in Turkey gradually. However, the most significant tendency that the table shows is related to the service sector. The number of women working in the service sector was doubled from 2004 to 2012; and the rate of increase is higher for women than men.

Table 3: Labour Force Distribution by Sector, Turkey (1000 persons) WOMEN

Year	Agriculture	%	Industry	%	Construction	%	Services	%	Total
2004	2.565	50,82	784	15,54	26	0,51	1.672	33,13	5.047
2005	2.367	46,34	819	16,03	28	0,55	1.895	37,55	5.108
2006	2.295	43,64	823	15,65	37	0,73	2.104	41,68	5.258
2007	2.288	42,72	824	15,39	36	0,71	2.208	43,75	5.356
2008	2.354	42,06	834	14,90	42	0,83	2.366	46,88	5.595
2009	2.445	41,65	857	14,60	40	0,79	2.530	50,13	5.871
2010	2.724	42,40	966	15,04	56	1,11	2.680	53,11	6.425
2011	2.944	42,22	1.003	14,38	54	1,07	2.973	58,91	6.973
2012 Haziran	3.227	41,97	1.041	13,54	61	1,21	3.359	66,56	7.688

Resource: Turkish Statistical Institute (TÜİK) Household Labour Force Survey, June 2012.

Table 4: Labour Force Distribution by Sector, Turkey (1000 persons) MEN

Year	Agriculture	%	Industry	%	Construction	%	Services	%	Total
2004	3.148	21,58	3.145	21,56	941	6,45	7.352	50,40	14.585
2005	2.787	19,11	3.364	23,06	1.080	7,40	7.728	52,99	14.959
2006	2.613	17,92	3.460	23,72	1.159	7,95	7.933	54,39	15.165
2007	2.578	17,68	3.489	23,92	1.196	8,20	8.119	55,66	15.382
2008	2.663	18,26	3.606	24,72	1.200	8,23	8.130	55,74	15.598
2009	2.795	19,16	3.222	22,09	1.266	8,68	8.124	55,70	15.406
2010	2.959	20,29	3.528	24,19	1.376	9,43	8.306	56,95	16.170
2011	3.199	21,93	3.701	25,37	1.622	11,12	8.617	59,08	17.137
2012 Haziran	3.328	22,82	3.718	25,49	1.861	12,76	8.980	61,57	17.888

Resource: Turkish Statistical Institute (TÜİK) Household Labour Force Survey, June 2012.

Women's employment by sectors on the regional basis indicates that the share of services sector in women's employment is higher than that of agriculture only in 7 of the 26 regions. In none of those regions the share of industry in women's employment overrides those of other sectors. In the 5 regions, where industry employs more than 20 percent of the women in provincial employment, traditionally pink-collar industrial branches like textiles and food processing are concentrated.

Table 5: Women's Employment by Economic Activities in 2011 (Level 2)

	TURKEY		
	Agriculture (%)	Industry (*) (%)	Service (%)
TOTAL	42.2	15.2	42.6
TR10 (İstanbul)	0.4	32.3	67.4
TR21 (Tekirdağ, Edirne, Kırklareli)	25.2	32.1	42.7
TR22 (Balıkesir, Çanakkale)	54.6	9.1	36.3
TR31 (İzmir)	19.1	20.7	60.2
TR32 (Aydın, Denizli, Muğla)	50.9	11.8	37.3
TR33 (Manisa, Afyon, Kütahya, Uşak)	66.4	10.5	23.1
TR41 (Bursa, Eskişehir, Bilecik)	19.6	32.1	48.3
TR42 (Kocaeli, Sakarya, Düzce, Bolu, Yalova)	38.2	22.0	39.8
TR51 (Ankara)	7.0	10.1	83.0
TR52 (Konya, Karaman)	57.0	15.7	27.3
TR61 (Antalya, Isparta, Burdur)	48.4	6.2	45.3
TR62 (Adana, Mersin)	45.4	10.2	44.4
TR63 (Hatay, Kahramanmaraş, Osmaniye)	59.7	8.0	32.4
TR71 (Kırıkkale, Aksaray, Niğde, Nevşehir, Kırşehir)	59.1	5.4	35.5
TR72 (Kayseri, Sivas, Yozgat)	65.6	10.0	24.4
TR81 (Zonguldak, Karabük, Bartın)	66.4	8.0	25.5
TR82 (Kastamonu, Çankırı, Sinop)	73.5	7.1	19.4
TR83 (Samsun, Tokat, Çorum, Amasya)	65.3	7.8	26.9
TR90 (Trabzon, Ordu, Giresun, Rize, Artvin, Gümüşhane)	78.7	3.8	17.5
TRA1 (Erzurum, Erzincan, Bayburt)	75.5	4.7	19.8
TRA2 (Ağrı, Kars, Iğdır, Ardahan)	85.8	2.1	12.2
TRB1 (Malatya, Elazığ, Bingöl, Tunceli)	66.0	5.8	28.3
TRB2 (Van, Muş, Bitlis, Hakkari)	79.4	1.2	19.3
TRC1 (Gaziantep, Adıyaman, Kilis)	45.9	15.2	38.9
TRC2 (Şanlıurfa, Diyarbakır)	57.0	57.2.7	40.2
TRC3 (Mardin, Batman, Şırnak, Siirt)	35.6	6.9	5

Resource: Turkish Statistical Institute (TÜİK) Household Labour Force Survey, June 2012.

4 According to the report of "Woman's State in Turkey" that was published by Directorate General on the Status of Women (KSGM), there is no legal discrimination against women in Turkey in terms of their entrance into the work life and maintenance of the work life. However women face various discriminations in the work life such as social pressure as a result of the assumption that certain jobs and sectors are inappropriate for women; inequality in work distribution; discharge of women employees primarily in periods of financial crisis; low wages especially in informal sectors. (KSGM, 2012: 25).

INTRODUCTION

The following table shows the state of women's employment in NUTS 2 regions according to labour market status and sector of employment..

Table 6: Labour Market Status of Women and Sectoral Composition of Women's Employment in NUT2 Regions

	Labour Force Participation Rate (%)	Unemployment Rate (%)	Employment Rate (%)	Agriculture	Industry	Service
TOTAL	28.8	11.3	25.6	42.2	15.2	42.6
TR10 (İstanbul)	25.2	15.2	21.4	0.4	32.3	67.4
TR22 (Balıkesir, Çanakkale)	29.2	6.2	27.4	54.6	9.1	36.3
TR31 (İzmir)	33.9	21.1	26.7	19.1	20.7	60.2
TR32 (Aydın, Denizli, Muğla)	37.8	10.5	33.9	50.9	11.8	37.3
TR42 (Kocaeli, Sakarya, Düzce, Bolu, Yalova)	34	15.2	28.8	38.2	22	39.8
TR51 (Ankara)	25.6	12.3	22.5	7	10.1	83
TR61 (Antalya, Isparta, Burdur)	40.5	11.4	35.9	48.4	6.2	45.3
TR62 (Adana, Mersin)	31.4	13.7	27.1	45.4	10.2	44.4
TR90 (Trabzon, Ordu, Giresun, Rize, Artvin, Gümüşhane)	44	4.7	41.9	78.7	3.8	17.5
TRB2 (Van, Muş, Bitlis, Hakkari)	22.7	8.8	20.7	79.4	1.2	19.3
TRC2 (Şanlıurfa, Diyarbakır)	7.9	3	7.7	57	2.7	40.2

As well as the uneven distribution of **women's employment** between regions and the tendency to concentrate in a limited number of sectors, women's conditions in the work life reveal significant inequalities. The employment status composition of working women indicates the gender-based vertical segregation, entrance barriers, and the existence of glass ceilings. Only 12,9 per cent of working women are self-employed and hold employer statuses while 51,6 percent of working women are waged-labourers and 35,5 percent are unpaid family workers.⁵

According to the Turkish Statistical Institute's August 2012 Household Labour Force Survey, 62,1 per cent of the women who do not participate in the labour force mention "being housewife" as the reason of their not participating in the labour force. In some regions this rate is extremely high (See Table-6).

⁵ Informal employment rate is very high not only in terms of un-waged family labour but also for self-employment (See Appendix-5).

Table 7: The Reasons for Not Participating in the Labour Force (Level 2)

	Number of women who don't participate in labour force	The number of women who don't participate because of house work	The rate of women who don't participate because of house work
TOTAL	19,414	11,872	61
TR10 (<i>Istanbul</i>)	3,673	2,224	61
TR21 (<i>Tekirdağ, Edirne, Kırklareli</i>)	409	153	37
TR22 (<i>Balıkesir, Çanakkale</i>)	470	287	61
TR31 (<i>İzmir</i>)	1,045	564	54
TR32 (<i>Aydın, Denizli, Muğla</i>)	696	352	51
TR33 (<i>Manisa, Afyon, Kütahya, Uşak</i>)	719	498	69
TR41 (<i>Bursa, Eskişehir, Bilecik</i>)	1,005	743	74
TR42 (<i>Kocaeli, Sakarya, Düzce, Bolu, Yalova</i>)	832	582	70
TR51 (<i>Ankara</i>)	1,363	990	73
TR52 (<i>Konya, Karaman</i>)	601	266	44
TR61 (<i>Antalya, Isparta, Burdur</i>)	597	241	40
TR62 (<i>Adana, Mersin</i>)	936	388	41
TR63 (<i>Hatay, Kahramanmaraş, Osmaniye</i>)	758	351	46
TR71 (<i>Kırıkkale, Aksaray, Niğde, Nevşehir, Kırşehir</i>)	434	323	74
TR72 (<i>Kayseri, Sivas, Yozgat</i>)	598	411	69
TR81 (<i>Zonguldak, Karabük, Bartın</i>)	231	136	59
TR82 (<i>Kastamonu, Çankırı, Sinop</i>)	161	48	30
TR83 (<i>Samsun, Tokat, Çorum, Amasya</i>)	660	389	59
TR90 (<i>Trabzon, Ordu, Giresun, Rize, Artvin, Gümüşhane</i>)	554	278	50
TRA1 (<i>Erzurum, Erzincan, Bayburt</i>)	247	156	63
TRA2 (<i>Ağrı, Kars, Iğdır, Ardahan</i>)	239	166	69
TRB1 (<i>Malatya, Elazığ, Bingöl, Tunceli</i>)	461	276	60
TRB2 (<i>Van, Muş, Bitlis, Hakkari</i>)	471	276	59
TRC1 (<i>Gaziantep, Adıyaman, Kilis</i>)	698	567	81
TRC2 (<i>Şanlıurfa, Diyarbakır</i>)	964	781	81
TRC3 (<i>Mardin, Batman, Şırnak, Siirt</i>)	590	426	72

Resource: Turkish Statistical Institute data set

On the other hand, not only the quantitative level of women's employment but also the quality of the employment is a serious problem. The discrimination against women, low-wages, sexist division of labour in the household are some other factors which increase the problems about women's employment by undervaluing women's labour. ⁶

6 More on the issue can be found in the section titled "Findings of the Research"

INTRODUCTION

The Women as well as being squeezed to some particular sectors and employment statuses are also earn lower wages compared to men working in the equivalent economic sectors and positions. When the average daily-earning level of the women in the formal sector (who are registered to the Social Security Institution) is compared to daily earning level of the men in the formal sector, it is ascertained that women earn less than men.⁷ According to a research dated 2007, the wage difference between women and men holding equivalent jobs and positions is about 46 % (Toksöz, 2007). In the sectors women concentrated, this rate increases in favor of men (when calculated according to the Social Security Institution records). According to TEPAV's (Economic Policy Research Foundation of Turkey) calculations, on daily basis men earn 3,78 Turkish liras more than women, which corresponds to a monthly rate of 8 %.⁸ As the data of the Turkish Statistical Institute confirm, in agricultural sectors the daily wages of women and children are much lower than men. Unregistered employment and flexible employment are other factors that lower women's wages compared to men.

Low wage is widespread in Turkey as a characteristic of women's employment. In this sense, we can argue that low wage is an unnamed policy concerning women's employment. It is not only through the daily wage that we encounter low wage policies. These policies include employing women workers without social insurance, not reflecting overtime pay to the insurance premiums or not paying for overtime work at all, denying use of annual leave, not providing the necessary working facilities such as transportation or meal services and the lack of nursing room or childcare facilities at work places which directly affect women employees. Although many workers, both men and women, are subjected to low wage policies, there are many examples showing that women are facing this problem more severely. For instance, many employers do not provide social insurance for their women employees on the grounds that their husbands are already registered in the social security system. Moreover, many women employees are reported and insured as minimum wage earners instead of their actual salaries. Most of the women workers cannot object to this situation on the grounds that they are paid an extra amount uncovered by social security and that amount is crucial since they earn already very low wages.. Employers do not consider women as "permanent" workers due to the assumptions that marriage and pregnancy will lead them to leave the job. The high level of employment turnover rate and easiness of hiring/firing women employees affect women's working conditions and job security negatively. Union membership is harder for women compared to men due to the obstacles created both by their families and the employers. Furthermore, the masculine culture and structure of the labour unions becomes another obstacle for

7 In general, women who work in registered sectors earn 1,85 Turkish liras less than men, in daily basis. According to TEPAV's Employment Watch Report in August 2012 this amount refers to 4 % of women's daily earnings.

8 Social Security Institutions' data is not reliable for making a comparison between men's and women's earnings. A comparison depending on solely the registered workers is insufficient. Besides, employers make their employees' registrations to the system (especially women's) with minimum wage level instead of their actual salaries. Moreover, recently it was revealed that many employees who are registered to the Social Security System through minimum wage, pay some amount of money that the employer puts to the bank insurance premiums back to the employer because their agreed wage levels are lower. Many juridical trials on the subject continue. On the other hand, almost 1 to 3 of the women working in the sectors other than agriculture, are employed without insurance and registration to Social Security System. For more information, see Toksöz, Gülay (2007) "Report on The State of Woman's Employment in Turkey" ILO, Ankara.

women. Therefore, women workers' demands are usually overlooked in collective labour agreements.

Upon increased public visibility of the issue of working conditions of women with the resistance movements women workers have organized in the recent past in various sectors and firms such as Novamed, Turkish Airlines (THY), Hey Tekstil, Çağrı Merkezleri (call centers), many forms of discriminative practices employers use against women workers have been testified and better identified. Those practices include mobilizing oppressive family relations to the aims of labour control via making the woman's daily wage or salary payment to her family, (or threatening with) talking to family members about the problems at work, shortening the breaks, making women sign contracts involving articles about not getting married and/or pregnant and so on. These examples do not only target the unskilled women; but reflect common set of discriminative strategies used also against skilled women. Many skilled women employees working in various sectors such as banking, livestock, health, services (such as call centers), chemistry face barriers set by the glass ceilings and forced to sign illegal contracts which include articles on not getting married and/or pregnant as an example of the cross-cutting commonality in the use of sexist body politics against women of all social classes in work life.

On the other hand, lack of nursing rooms or childcare centers which defines the norm in work places in spite of the fact that the employers are legally obliged to provide such facilities, is an important factor in women's disengagement with work life. Employers consider their responsibility of providing such services not as a binding legal requirement but as the "cost" of employing women which need to be evaded either not employing women or paying the legal penalty for infringing the law.

The long working hours is another factor which drives women workers out of labour market. Women workers are able to tolerate the long working hours and increase their salaries by overtime payments only if they are able to transfer their works at home such as housework and care of child-elderly-patient-disabled to other women. However, this transfer of house and care works to other women does not usually last long. Consequently, women are not able to afford the "high cost of working" unless they receive "sufficient" wages.

FINDINGS OF THE RESEARCH

The findings of the research will be examined in two dimensions. First, the policies about women's employment will be classified under the titles of "getting into employment," "staying in employment" and "creating employment". Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Board (İİMEK) will also be examined as a mechanism which operates to determine the policies on entrepreneurship and vocational education. The second dimension of the examination is about the gender perspective within the local and central policy texts/documents (such as strategic plans, activity reports, budget and performance plans etc.). Also the impact assessments of certain practices, and monitoring of particular activities and programs are included in this section. Thus, a set of questions encapsulating 13 articles of the Prime Ministerial Circular was prepared and findings reached as a result of these questions are gathered together.

POLICIES ON WOMEN'S EMPLOYMENT

a. GETTING INTO EMPLOYMENT

Women's entrance into employment is very much dependent on certain conditions. The presence of the childcare center and other working conditions as the way they are determined in the Labour Law, the safety of the working place, transportation, and meal services provided by the employer and regular payment play role in determining women's entrance and staying in employment as much as the wage does. The endeavors about increasing firms' demands to employ women labour force and improving women's employment are conducted through the vocational education programs and entrepreneurship activities in the context of Active Labour Force Policies.

However both in these fields and the sectors in which women are employed, women are directed towards particular working areas. In this context, the segregation that women are subjected to on the basis of sectors and skills –in other words horizontal segregation- and the presence of glass ceilings are significant obstacles for women's employment, as the data collected from 12 provinces for this research confirms. In this context, the research findings concerning the Circular articles can be seen below. Since there are no articles in the Circular on the vertical and horizontal segregation, "childcare center and care services" and "vocational education programs" are presented as two sub-chapters under the title "getting into employment"

a.1. Childcare Center and Care Services

Childcare and day care centers, elderly/patient/disabled care centers are significant necessities for women's entrance into employment and sustaining it. In 2012 two protocols -in which articles concerning these issues took place- were signed. Article 88 of the Labor Law numbered 4857 and "Regulation on Working Conditions of Pregnant and Nursing Women, Nursing Rooms and Childcare Centers" numbered 25522 and entering into force with its publication in Official Journal on 14th of July 2004 sets out how to structure the childcare centers in detail. Article 33 of the Prime Ministerial Circular No. 2010/14 which is the main motivation source for this research also declares that "childcare and day care centers which are legal obligations for public and private work places as it was issued by the Labour Law numbered 4857 will be established and inspected." However in the provinces that we have conducted the research we observed that the childcare and nursing centers were shut down instead of being renewed and improved. Although women's organizations brought the public care service support as a major demand to the agenda, it is hard to say that central and local administrations have adopted a holistic policy concerning the childcare centers and nursery classes. Since public support mechanisms do not work properly, private childcare centers and privatized care services are the main actors in the scene. High cost of private childcare centers cause women's withdrawal from the working life. On the other hand, present state of the childcare support that is provided by the employer as a legal obligation is quite insufficient and problematic. The recent legal arrangements brought a new option for the employers to the agenda in order to decrease the "labour force cost": instead of opening childcare centers at the work place, they are enabled to provide childcare support as cash transfer to the women employees.

Another option that was brought to the agenda as a result of the same idea to decrease the labour force cost was building childcare centers in the social areas of the Organized Industrial Zones (OSB). Within the 12 provinces that this research was conducted, only in İstanbul Dudullu Organized Industrial Zone, a childcare center -with a capacity for 300 children- was present. This childcare center started to serve in September 2012. However the price of the childcare center is quite high. The childcare center in Denizli Organized Industrial Zone has been giving service since 2000. But according to women's organizations this childcare center is insufficient because there is only one childcare center for the two Organized Industrial Zones in the area. Investments for opening childcare centers in the Organized Industrial Zones of Manisa and Gaziantep -which are not in the scope of this research- took place in national media. Also in Diyarbakır the works for the establishment of childcare centers both for the Organized Industrial Zone and the Textile City project were continuing. The same steps were observed in the case of Van and Şanlıurfa Zones, too. In all the provinces that we have conducted this research our offer to establish childcare centers in Organized Industrial Zones was received positively. However, it was also interesting to see that the administrators did not even know whether there was a childcare center in the Organized Industrial Zone of their city or not. In one of the two free zones in İzmir there is one childcare center. And in İzmir Atatürk Organized Industrial Zone there is a childcare center with 150 children capacity. Especially after the protocol signed in February 2012, between the Ministry of Science, Technology and Industry and the Ministry of Family and Social Policies, the projects about establishing childcare centers in Organized Industrial Zones gained currency. Other than those positive examples mentioned above, during our research we have not come across any other Organized Industrial Zone or free zone having a childcare center.

The most significant criticisms of women's organizations and labour organizations for the existing childcare centers are: the high prices of the centers, the lack of fit between the women's work shifts and working hours of the center, low capacity of the centers (compared to the number of employees), and the structuring of the childcare center as a nursery class for the children above 3.

Beside Organized Industrial Zones and free zones, childcare centers and other child care options are also insufficient in city centers and neighborhoods. Child care services are left to private sector to a considerable extent. The cost of private childcare centers is very high. This situation causes women's withdrawal from the work life.

Childcare support provided by the employer as additional payment or service procurement is insufficient. During our interviews we have also noticed that the efforts of the Non-Governmental Organizations on providing child care service free of charge are usually stuck in bureaucratic difficulties and could not be maintained. According to İlkaracan's research on the subject, the rate for providing childcare and pre-school education in Turkey is 16 per cent. İlkaracan (2011) also shows that there is no childcare center for the children under 3; the options for the children between 3 and 5 year old are very limited and the state takes no responsibility for the issue other than providing 16 weeks of maternal leave to the women employees. Besides, İlkaracan draws attention to following rates: only 4 % of the children under 3, 16 %

POLICIES ON WOMEN'S EMPLOYMENT

of the 4 years-old children, and 61 % of the 5 years-old children are able to participate in the pre-school education in Turkey.

When we look at the state in the research provinces, we see that there are two childcare centers in Antalya established by the local administrations; however according to the women's organizations, these centers fail to give service to the women and children in need. The number of private childcare centers in Antalya is quite a lot as it is in urban spaces such as İstanbul, İzmir, Ankara etc. However, due to the high cost of these private childcare centers, not every child is able to benefit from them. On the other hand, it has been observed that in Denizli "learning houses" which serve as study centers replaced the previous childcare centers run by the city municipality. The reason for this significant change is explained by the officials as the "low demand for the centers and the wider age range that the study center services can cover". However, the women living in the province do not agree with this reasoning. According to them "the municipality's childcare centers received high demand and the demand still exists since people are seriously in need of childcare centers in the province". In Urfa and İstanbul, although there are childcare centers run by local administrations, these centers fail to provide the needed service capacity. In Trabzon and Diyarbakır, childcare centers of the municipalities' were also shut down; but re-opening of those centers is taken in the agenda. Another problem beside the lack of childcare centers that has come to the fore in all the provinces, is the working hours of the childcare centers. For instance, working hours of the childcare centers which are open only during the day do not fit the need of parents working in shifts.

All the institutions that we have contacted confirmed the need for childcare centers for the working women and evaluated the childcare center problem as a significant obstacle before women's employment. However, it has been observed that local institutions and administrations are unable to create any policy on care services due to insufficiency of their budgets and lack of decision making power independent from the central administration. Women's organizations' demands about the childcare centers are not met. During the interviews with the officials from the Development Agency, it was articulated that childcare center investments could be encouraged by the financial and social support programs and through changes in the guides. In summary, it is hard to say that central and local administrations have a holistic policy about the childcare centers. Beside childcare centers, nursing rooms are another significant necessity for women's employment. Detailed information about this issue will be shared in the final report. We have focused only on the issue of care services within the scope of this mid-term report, because only childcare and day care centers were mentioned within care services in the articles of the Ministerial Circular.

On the other hand, another issue that should be mentioned about childcare service is that in the scope of vocational trainings for women, babysitting certificate programs are included heavily in every province. However, it is detected that women who get this training do not apply for jobs with their baby-sitter certificates. Women usually stay away from the jobs that needs to be performed in other people's houses. This issue will be examined in the following pages under the title "vocational trainings" in detail.

a.2. Vocational Trainings

Increasing the employment through the active labour force policies has gained importance during the period of eighth five-year development plan. Active labour force market policies (AİPP) which aim to increase the employability of the labour force by improving the skills and efficiency of it, involve general work life trainings, vocational/skill trainings and labour force adjustment programs, establishment of vocational counseling and guidance services and services targeting improvement of the job search strategies of job-seekers. The “disadvantageous groups” classified as the unemployed, disabled, women and youth come to the fore as the common target group of these policies. Relevant policies generally contain entrepreneurship trainings, employment-guaranteed training programs and , from 2008 on, temporary public employment services (TYÇP) which was started upon 2008 economic crisis.

Beside the problems about the classification of the mentioned disadvantageous groups, active labour force policies are problematic for taking unemployment as a simple supply-demand issue. This approach becomes clear in the provincial labour force analyses prepared on local basis. The programming of the vocational trainings is made in accordance with those analyses. The interviews we conducted and the documents we examined in the scope of this research show similar results valid for all the provinces. First, the temporary public employment services (TYÇP) -which is a common program applied as one of the solutions for unemployment- does not guarantee employment after the employment within the context of the programme ends. Particularly in provinces such as Trabzon, Diyarbakır, Şanlıurfa, Van, Adana the program (TYÇP) reaches a large working-age population. However, the program lasts for 3 to 8 months. It does not provide permanent employment nor does it provide any additional working skills to the employer. Therefore, the claims that this program creates continuing employment for unemployed is not substantiated. Second, the training programs are arranged according to the provincial labour force market analyses. Labour force market needs analysis is conducted collaboratively by the universities and private sector through service outsourcing. The local actors are not content with those analyses and they claim that the reports do not reflect the reality and that the analyses only reflect the short-term tendencies. Therefore, the vocational trainings based on those analyses can only meet short-term needs which will change every six months or annually. The gender perspective within these analyses is perfunctory. The vocational trainings that are suggested to the women do not include competitive sectors of the province nor do the jobs offered to them go beyond the traditional “woman’s jobs”.

“The State of Woman” report of the General Directorate on the Status of Woman (KSGM) (2012) involves a finding about the vocational trainings: “The more women’s educational level increases, the more their options to participate in the labour force increases. However in each level of education unequal conditions for women still exist. Although this inequality is hoped to be resolved in the future, knowledge and skill based trainings for women are needed beside the formal education in order to improve the quality of women’s labour force”. In contrast with KSGM’s finding, in provincial labour force analyses, -even though it is seen on the tables that unemployed man and women have different qualities and unemployed women too have professions- tables are interpreted as putting men’s unemployment to the center. Women’s and local capi-

POLICIES ON WOMEN'S EMPLOYMENT

tal organizations' most important criticisms is that vocational courses even if they are employment guaranteed cannot actually resolve unemployment problem. They also complain that the money that is transferred from the unemployment fund is being distributed to firms which have no relation with training, thus being wasted away. It is also claimed that some counseling companies which started vocational training programs do not really give any training but only form claptrap show-programs in order to obtain financial resources. Moreover, in recent years the dominant approach in the employment policies is "keeping the balance between flexibility and security at the labour market". Therefore, it is very disputable whether these activities could empower women while increasing their participation in economic and social life.

The Development Agencies which support "Placing Gender Equality into Master Plans and Policies" approach, set their goals as the following: providing easier access to child and other care services in order to encourage women to participate in work life, improving the provisional vocational training options, improving women's efficiency in decision-making mechanisms and establishing better employment options for women staying in shelters. However, it is commonly accepted that those aims have not been achieved up until today.

In summary, the activities about employment in the research provinces are being structured in accordance with "active labour force employment policies" through temporary public employment programs, vocational trainings and job counseling services, collaboratively with the development agencies.

In Turkey 61 % of the 3.588.355 persons who have attended the courses in the Public Education Centers; 18 % of the 284.543 trainees that have attended the courses in Vocational Training Centers (TÜİK, 2009-2010); 90 % of the 52.549 students that have attended the schools of Technical Education for Girls (General Directorate of Technical Education for Girls, 2010-2011) are women. In 2011, 60.695 persons attended the employment-guaranteed courses, and 33.717 (55 %) of these participants were women. The number of women who were employed through employment-guaranteed courses is 15.379. According to Turkish Employment Agency's (İŞKUR) 2011 data, regional job placement rates are as following: in Marmara region job placement rate for women is 23 % while the same rate for men is 35 %; in Aegean region job placement rate for women is 15 % and for men is 27 %; in Mediterranean region 17 % for women and 29 % for men; in Black Sea region 20 % for women and 31 % for men; in Central Anatolia region 17 % for women and 34 % for men; in Eastern Anatolia region 20 % for women and 29 % for men; and in Southeastern Anatolia region 8 % for women and 20 % for men. In the provinces that we have conducted the research we have also observed that the most of the attendees of the courses in Public Education Centers were women. Also the number of women who attended the Turkish Employment Agency's (İŞKUR) courses was quite a lot.

However, when the gender distribution of the persons who attend to vocational training is examined, the conflict between these rates and the policies of diminishing gender discrimination in work life can be noticed. Even though Turkish Employment Agency (İŞKUR) has removed gender preference from the forms, especially in

employment-guaranteed educations of the Agency, except a few exceptional works, the gender segregation continues due to the fact that jobs are determined according to the establishments' preferences. In the courses of the Project of Specialized Vocational Centers (UMEM) this gender discrimination is more clear. On the other hand, our interviewees have emphasized that even though vocational trainings for women work properly, the problems start in the recruitment level. The vocational trainings given in accordance with the active labour force policies, with a few exceptions, reproduce the traditional gender roles repeating the assumptions about woman's/man's job. In all the research provinces, we have observed that women are directed into the vocational trainings such as hairdressing, needle works, elderly and patient care. Those trainings that are planned according to non-permanent investment areas or areas outside regional needs do not help women in finding permanent employment.

Another problem on this issue is that in most of the vocational training centers there is neither a childcare center nor a play room for children. For women this lack creates an important obstacle against their attendance to courses. It is predicted that if childcare centers or play-rooms are established within vocational training centers, more women will be attending to the courses. For instance, it was observed that a vocational training center in İzmir with a play-room and nursery room for children receives much more applications from women compared with others.

Another significant issue that was observed in research provinces is that women predominantly attend to elderly/patient/child care courses. However, the officials from the training institutions draw attention to that, women attend those courses for the daily wage paid to women in the course of trainings, and they do not have any interest in finding a permanent employment in the field. However, those trainings continue to be given without considering the regional needs or women's demands.

b. STAYING IN EMPLOYMENT

b.1. Vertical Segregation

Sixth Article of the Circular sets out a principle in order to dispel gender discrimination in public institutions that women encounter in the processes of promotion, partaking in senior management and attending in-service training programs. When the state of women's employment in Turkey is reconsidered in this context, it can be seen that women's participation rate in specialized employment fields such as medicine or law is quite high while number of women partaking in public institutions' management levels is low and decreases as we go higher in the hierarchy. The representation level of women in senior management, boards, commissions, and committees is very low. According to State Staff Administration's 2011 data, 37 per cent of the persons that are employed in public agencies and institutes are women. The ratio of women in decision-making positions within the bureaucracy is also very low. Only 13 per cent of senior managers within the bureaucracy are women.⁹

⁹ *Banking and academy are exceptional sectors in the sense that glass ceilings operate differently in these sectors. For detailed information: Şemsa Özar&Gülşay Günlük Şensesen (1999) "Gender-Based Occupational Segregation in the Turkish Banking Sector", The Economics of Women and Work in the Middle East and North*

POLICIES ON WOMEN'S EMPLOYMENT

The rate of women instructors within the universities is 40,9 %.¹⁰ This ratio decreases as we follow the numbers from faculty membership to professorship (TÜİK, 2010-2011). Moreover, only in 10 out of 162 universities have woman rectors. 39 % of the architects (Chamber of Architects, March 2012); 38 % of lawyers (Union of Turkish Bar Associations, December 2011); 49,8 % of bankers (Union of Bank of Turkey, December 2011); and only 5,6 % of the police officers (TÜİK, 2011) are women.

According to Directorate General on the Status of Woman's (KSGM) "The State of Woman in Turkey" report which was published in April 2012, "There is only one women governor (in Yalova) in Turkey. Only 5 of the 458 deputy governors are women. Only 20 of the 861 district governors are women (Ministry of Internal Affairs General Directorate of Staff, November 2010). Only 5 of the 107 district governor candidates are women (Ministry of Internal Affairs General Directorate of Staff, March 2010). When we look at the state of women's employment within the bureaucracy, we see that there is no woman undersecretary and there are only 3 women working in the Ministries as deputy undersecretaries. There are only 6 woman general directors in Turkey working within the Ministries or institutions linked to ministries. Within 337 deputy general directors there are only 32 women and only 286 of 1976 heads of departments are women (KSGM, 2012:23).

In Turkey, 8,3 % of the prosecutors and 33, 6 % of the judges are women (The Supreme Board of Judges and Prosecutors/HSYK, October 2011). Our research findings depending on 12 provinces, confirm these overall statistics. In research provinces, we have observed that the state of women's employment in public agencies and institutions are very similar to the statistics; and the glass ceilings continue to exist. In the provinces we have conducted interviews, there was no woman governor, deputy governor or district governor. We have not encountered any woman within the provincial directors of National Education, provincial directors of Employment Agency, provincial directors of Small and Medium Industry Development Organization (KOSGEB), provincial directors of Ministry of Family and Social Policies (ASP). There was no woman within the secretary generals of the Chambers of Industry or Trade. In the public agencies and institutions, the women officials that we could interview were heads of departments, chiefs, deputy directors, and experts. Two positive exceptions on this situation are Diyarbakır and İzmir Municipalities in which many women directors are employed.

When questions concerning women employees' recruitment, promotion, attendance to in-service trainings are directed to the public institutions, the response turned out to be the same one everywhere, "There is no discrimination against women". However, when we asked questions about the distribution of staff and gender

Africa, 3 edited by Mine Çınar, Vol.4, *Research in Middle East Economics*, JAI Press, 2001, pp.247-267. And in Turkish: Özar ve Şenesen (2001) "Bankacılık Kesiminde Teknolojik Gelişmenin Kadın İstihdamı Üzerindeki Etkileri", TMMOB Sanayi Kongresi, İstanbul 30 Kasım, 1-2 Aralık 2001; Gülay Günlük Şenesen (1994) "Türkiye Üniversitelerinin Üst Yönetiminde Kadınların Konumu, 1990-1993", *Akademik Yaşamda Kadın Sempozyumu, Alman Kültür Merkezi, Ankara, 22-24 Eylül 1994*. Gülay Günlük Şenesen (2004) "Akademik Mesleğe 8 Mart Vesilesi ile bir Bakış", *Eğitim, Bilim, Toplum*, 2/5, 70-73.

10 According to KSGM'd data, the rate of woman professors is 27 %, while 32,2 % of the assistant professors and 39,1 % of faculty members are women (TÜİK, 2010-2011).

distribution of the directors, we have seen that the most of the staff and directors working in these institutions are men.

b.2. Attendance to In-service Trainings and the Quality of Education

Even though article 10 of the Prime Ministry Circular, sets out clearly that all formal education activities and vocational trainings should be planned in accordance with the measures on women's human rights, education and employment options, there is no such planning neither in Public Education Centers nor in Turkish Employment Agency's (İŞKUR) courses or in plans of in-service trainings. Nevertheless, Directorate-General of National Education in İzmir, Turkey's Labour Agency in Denizli, KOSGEB in Çanakkale applied to KEIG Platform for in service education on gender equality.

In general, when we mentioned women's human rights trainings or gender equality approach, the institutions we have contacted understood these as family, child and health educations. However, there were exceptions. In Diyarbakır and Urfa the development agency experts and job counselors had received trainings such as gender budgeting; in Diyarbakır there also gender courses and quota application as a result of the dominant political approach in the city and municipality; and as a result of participation in the Women-Friendly Cities Project in Trabzon, Antalya and İzmir there are some positive changes. Women-friendly Cities Project have positive influences on public institutions since in the cities participating in the project public officials received trainings on gender and prepared local gender equality action plans. Still, it is hard to say that gender equality approach has been included in all the plans and programs and the institutions share a holistic view point on gender. Moreover, there are also some training programs on gender in the provinces which has a pilot project on women's employment. At this point, the real problem is the lack of sustainability due to the planning of trainings on the basis of project-based temporary activities.

c. CREATING EMPLOYMENT

c.1. Women's Entrepreneurship

It is possible to argue that entrepreneurship support policy continues to be an important part of the efforts aiming to increase women's employment. Generally, it is envisaged that increased number of women entrepreneurs will help increasing women's employment rate.

Women entrepreneurship is commonly seen as a "necessity entrepreneurship"¹¹ in the areas that women's traditional roles are maintained and do not bring women money. It was observed that women entrepreneurs who have a large capital either maintain family business or got the initial capital from their families.

11 For detailed information:
<http://in.bgu.ac.il/women-forum/DocLib/research/GenderdifferencesinEntrepreneurshepEqualitydiversi.pdf>
http://www.tobb.org.tr/Lists/Haberler/Attachments/724/GEM_TURKIYE_2010_RAPORU.pdf
http://mpr.a.ub.uni-muenchen.de/29506/2/MPRA_paper_29506.pdf

POLICIES ON WOMEN'S EMPLOYMENT

Women's entrepreneurship is commonly supported by micro credits, KOSGEB's trainings, grants and credits. In those schemes of support, positive discrimination is implemented for women entrepreneurs. (27.000 TL grant is given in the scope of the Entrepreneurship Project Support Program conducted by KOSGEB and İŞKUR). In regions listed to have priority in incentive programs, 1 and 2 the ratio of provided grant for the projects is for men 60 % and for women [and for "disabled"] entrepreneurs 70 %. Priority regions from 3 to 6, men entrepreneurs get 70 percent while women [and "disabled"] entrepreneurs get 80 percent grant. The support level of the credit -up to 70.000 TL.- that is given to the new entrepreneurs is the same¹²).

On the other side, in the research provinces, we have observed that, although many women have taken entrepreneurship trainings, the most important obstacle in front of women who desire to start up with their own businesses is finding seed capital to start a business. Second significant problem emerges during the deterrent bureaucratic processes. Those problems are resistant to the existing positive discrimination policies KOSGEB and development agencies adopt for women by the measured mentioned above. It is not possible to obtain any information from monitoring-assessment reports of those policy measures. The KOSGEB's general policy assumption that women entrepreneurship would contribute to women's employment has been accepted by local KOSGEB offices without any reservation. In lack of any critical examination of the women's entrepreneurship policy, monitoring and inspection is based on solely checking and reporting the number of women getting entrepreneurship training.

KOSGEB is considered as one of the most important mechanisms for improving "opportunity entrepreneurship". KOSGEB and the capital organizations particularly draw attention to the crucial importance of monitoring the establishments and providing consultancy support in order to improve women's entrepreneurship. KOSGEB commonly directs those who want to set up a business to "familiar jobs" and thus, women entrepreneurs either continue family- businesses or their fields of business become very limited. Commonly, women entrepreneurs start business in the sectors such as fashion, textile, personal services, care, and cleaning services and food.

Business Incubators for Women Entrepreneurs (KİŞGEM) is an important endeavor in terms of supporting women entrepreneurs and providing a space for women entrepreneurs to be together. However the process of women's entrepreneurship –as in employment process- cannot be actualized by individual efforts. Coexistence of women or providing low rates and low cost options for them are not sufficient for women due to given conditions of the current social structure. For instance the location and physical conditions of Pendik KİŞGEM is not suitable for women. The lack of childcare centers and similar social facilities also affects women's chances of gaining a footage in those spaces negatively. Shortly, as a result of the weak/adjunct gender perspective dominating them, the reviewed support mechanisms severely lack complementary services necessary for integrating women into entrepreneurship and

12 For more information. <http://www.kosgeb.gov.tr/Pages/UI/Destekler.aspx?ref=8&refContent=69>

employment in general and the responsible institutions and actors are unable to identify needs and project improvements thereupon.

Although KOSGEB supports small and medium sized enterprises (KOBİ), it is different from the microcredit programs which aim to create micro enterprises. Microcredit programs are commonly and extensively implemented particularly in Diyarbakır and Şanlıurfa; and those programs exemplify typical policies dealing with “necessity entrepreneurship”. Particularly in the provinces that we have conducted interviews, it is noticed that the microcredit distributed by Special Provincial Administrations and Turkish Foundation for Waste Reduction (Türkiye İsrافی Önleme Vakfı) is presented as a “miraculous” solution. During our interviews, microcredit was presented as the most important support mechanism for women by local administrators. However, microcredit programs have been criticized by many researchers for transferring the production chain into the home, increasing informal employment, failing to take cautions for dangerous working conditions and increasing the exploitation of women through debiting them.

c.2. Unregistered Employment and Home-Based Work

In the industry and services sector, women's and children's labour are intensively employed in unregistered establishments without any social right and security. Informal labour of self-employed women and seasonal workers¹³ in agricultural sector, and home-based workers and women workers in domestic services are most remarkable examples. During the interviews conducted for the research although some effort was noticed on agricultural employment, it is not possible to state the same for home-based employment or women who are obliged to engage with domestic services or sex work.¹⁴

In the article 12 of the Prime Ministerial Circular, although it is recommended to conduct researches and collect systematic data on home-based work, no particular institution is addressed for the responsibility of the issue. As a result, during our interviews in 12 provinces, we observed that public institutions do not consider themselves as the addressee of the issue nor do they think of any relation or connection between the issue and their institutions. Accordingly, invisibility of the issue is maintained by the public administrations. There is no data on the subject nor is there any endeavor to collect data. Even in the cities such as Denizli, İzmir and Diyarbakır where home-based works most commonly performed, there is a state of ignoring and not seeing those activities performed by home-based workers, domestic workers, and sex workers as economic work.

13 Women working in the agriculture sector, most of the time cannot be registered to the social security system due to the fact that they either have very low and no income as a result of being wage-less family labourer. (KSGM, 2012:33)

14 Until 2006, employers who had a status of worker were registered to the Social Security Institution (SSK), whereas employers who had civil servant status were registered to State Retirement Fund and those who worked independently were registered to the Bağ-Kur (Social Security Institution for Artisans and the Self-Employed). These three different social security institutions were brought together under the same roof by the Social Security Institution Law numbered 5502 that was issued on 20th May 2006. However there are still many women who are not registered to the social voluntary insurance for 'housewives' is very limited due to the high cost of insurance premiums, for being dependent on the husband at the payment and the lack of sufficient knowledge about the system (KSGM, 2012: 33)

POLICIES ON WOMEN'S EMPLOYMENT

d. PROVINCIAL EMPLOYMENT AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION BOARD (İİMEK) MEETINGS, ATTENDANCE TO THE MEETINGS AND AGENDAS

Article 8 and Article 9 of the Circular takes up the issues of adding a gender perspective to formation, responsibility area and work schedule of İİMEKs; and article 10 addresses the need of reconsidering the arrangements on vocational trainings in accordance with the policies “equality of opportunity for women and men”. However, uncertain expressions in these articles and the lack of development of any criteria that could enable the inspection of the issue is striking. Moreover, again in the article 10, the addressee of the arrangement is uncertain.

İİMEKs are responsible with coming up with strategies and taking measures for the improving employment and labour market conditions particularly using active labour market policy programs, managing vocational training programs and policies; monitoring and assessing the implementation and impact of those active labour market programs.

Within the scope of the research provinces, the level of inclusion of women's NGOs in İİMEKs activities and policy production processes is observed to present a direct correlation with the degree of influence and efficiency women's organizations have in a particular province. İİMEKs tend to accept women's NGOs in the provinces if they call themselves as organizations of ‘women entrepreneur’, ‘business women’ and the like. Governor's and local administrator's authorization to choose between the woman's organizations for participation in İİMEK meetings constitutes another exclusive arrangement. For the women's organizations taking part in the KEİG Platform, formal inclusion in İİMEK processes has not happened upon an invitation from İİMEKs in their provinces. Rather it turned out to be a result of their long and serious struggle for it.¹⁵

On the other hand, in of the İİMEK meetings in those provinces, neither an agenda item related with the issues about women's labour and employment was presented nor did any of the board members mention such an agenda. The single exception was seen in Trabzon İİMEK; in one of the meetings women's employment became a topic of discussion.

¹⁵ The women's organizations participating in KEİG Platform in İzmir were invited to İİMEK meetings after the interviews we conducted with them during research.

WOMEN'S LABOUR IN LOCAL AND CENTRAL POLICY TEXTS/DOCUMENTS

Within the scope of research provinces, it is difficult to say that the institutional texts/documents such as strategic plans, activity reports, and performance programs include any gender perspective –with a few exceptions- contrary to what was set out by the article 4 of the Circular. The issues concerning women do not appear in these texts/documents; and when they do they are only addressed within the fields of health and vocational trainings reflecting a fixed traditional perception and approach. Some facilities, even if not directly sexist, cause sexism with regards to their outcomes; and in this respect these text/documents can be defined as gender-blind. Furthermore, albeit the lack of gendered data that can be collected on provincial basis, there are some important improvements concerning the article 12 of the Circular which suggests to collection of gender-based statistics. Particularly İİMEK activity reports and Development Agencies' regional plans commonly involve gendered data.

Article 5 of the Circular suggests that “equal opportunity impact assessment should be made while preparing the legislative drafts”. However, it has been observed that such an impact assessment has not been carried out; accordingly monitoring and assessment processes could not be handled effectively.

It was observed that the legislative impact assessment for the equality of women and men is carried out on project basis in institutions of some provinces. However, those impact assessment reports are not open to the public. The lack and discontinuity of the knowledge on the subject gives the impression that reporting of the impact assessment and the monitoring of the assessment procedures are carried out on project basis and thus temporary/periodic.

According to the assessment reports on project basis, women participate in vocational trainings more than men; but the sectors that women are trained on, are the sectors in which women already work intensively such as tailoring, textile, call centers. In reports while the negative influence of the vocational trainings as they reproduce the traditional gender roles can be seen clearly through the tables, no interpretation is presented on the subject. In these texts/documents there isn't any expressed aim to obliterate the segregation appearing along the division of man's/woman job. On the other hand, even if the trainings are conducted in a way meeting all the relevant criteria, the condition that causes unemployment will not change. In this sense, unemployment is structural. Therefore, reduction of the struggle against unemployment down to mere skill- and vocational trainings generates a paradox that also ap-

peared during the interviews. It is dramatically manifest itself in the ever increasing number of unemployed people who had participated in vocational training programs and got certificates. Authorities from the relevant public institutions try to account for this situation turning to the discourses revolving around “laziness” or “women’s continuing beauty sleep”. On the other hand, unemployed women who cannot get a job or cannot get permanent employment are disappointed; they start to blame themselves for this situation. According to the labour force market analyses, even though the state of unemployed women who do not accept a job due to its wage and work conditions and who cannot find job due to lack of experience are reflected in the statistics, while interpreting the tables and statistics no attention is paid to these. This is the same, ‘blame-the-victim’ approach observed in our interviews with authorities of public institutions, expressed a number of different ways all amounting to ‘pointing at the unemployed as the source of unemployment problem’.

Although most of the state institutions have developed gendered data collection systems in parallel with EU adjustment programs, it is not possible to see gender perspective integrated in the strategic plan objectives, performance indicators or in monitoring assessments.

In the provinces, protocols (can be seen in Appendix-1) in coherence with the Circular have been signed and projects have been conducted. However, majority of the institutions contacted are not conscious about these actives.

CONCLUSION

“The Survey on the State of Women’s Employment in Turkey”, aimed to assess whether the articles of the Prime Ministerial Circular No. 2010/14, named “Increasing Women’s Employment and Achieving Equal Opportunity” were put into practice or not making use of interviews in provinces and the published texts and documents on the subject. The initial findings of the research can be summarized as follows:

The Circular is not known/remembered –with a few exceptions- by the public institutions in the provinces. Some articles of the Circular are put into practice as show-measures, while some of them were not even considered and some articles were only integrated in project activities which are temporary in nature in some provinces. The statements and expressions within the Circular articles are uncertain and ambiguous. This factor and the lack of a sanction mechanism limit the efficiency of the Circular.

It is difficult to access reported information on the meetings and participants of the National Monitoring and Coordination Committee for Women’s Employment that was constituted in coherence with the Circular. Meanwhile, the process is not managed transparently. The work mechanism of the Board is not institutionalized and largely dependent on personal initiative. The board fails to achieve its duties defined in the Circular such as monitoring, assessment of, and coordination between relevant activities of stakeholders. The lack of a budget and sanction power reinforces the negative foresight on the future of the Board.

Assignments of the deputy undersecretaries to all ministries and the establishment of the departments of gender equality are not put into practice as they were suggested in the second article of the Circular. Only in some local administrations such departments were established in connection with projects such as Women-Friendly Cities. However, in none of the 12 research provinces exists a department which collect data about women’s employment in its body in a holistic way and which carries out operations other than the organization of trainings.

Article 3 of the Circular refers to the Labour Law and emphasizes the necessity of inclusion of gender equality issues within the audit reports. We were not able to gain access to these reports. However we encountered some examples of the reports on gender equality –especially in sectors in which women’s labour is extensively employed- through the interviews we conducted.

Article 4 in the Circular sets out the issues about inclusion of gender equality approach to the institutions' strategic plans, activity reports, and performance programs; also suggests supporting statistical data collection and scientific studies. The fourth article also arranges appropriate funds for the mentioned process. Accordingly, some of the statistical studies in the aforementioned texts are actually gender-disaggregated. Social Security Institution (SGK) and Turkish Statistical Institute (TÜİK) started to collect gender-disaggregated data. However, gender-based modeling in macro level has not been done yet. Moreover, in strategic plans, gender distribution of the staff enlarged upon variables such as seniority or assignment. In provisional level it is not possible to reach detailed data as presented in Household Labour Force Survey of 2010. Due to development agencies' special studies in some provinces and the correspondence of Level II (NUTS 2) territorial units with the province in İstanbul, Ankara and İzmir, there are some provincial level data. But the real problem is that the data is not suitable for comparison. In this situation, it gets harder to make an analysis. Gender approach in the mentioned texts/documents can only be seen in İzmir, Diyarbakır, Urfa and Trabzon in institutions such as municipalities and development agencies; in the other provinces cannot be encountered. Within the scope of research provinces, it is difficult to say that the institutional texts/documents such as strategic plans, activity reports, and performance programs include any gender perspective –with a few exceptions- as it was set out by the article 4 of the Circular. The issues concerning women do not appear in these texts/documents; and when they do they are only addressed within the fields of health, vocational training. Some facilities, even if not directly sexist, cause sexism with regards to their outcomes; and in this respect, these text/documents can be defined as gender-blind. It is interesting to see that even if the mentioned article of the Circular was put into practice, this was the result of particular persons' efforts and initiatives to direct the process; and this changes from institution to institution.

Article 5 in the Circular suggests taking equal opportunity impact assessments into consideration while preparing the legislative drafts. However, it was observed that such an impact assessment has not been carried out; accordingly monitoring and assessment processes could not be handled effectively.

Even though article 6 of the Prime Ministerial Circular set out a principle to dispel gender discrimination in public institutions that women encounter during the processes of promotion, partaking in senior management and attending in-service training programs, this principle is not put into practice in public agencies and institutions and hence, the glass ceilings still exist as the way they used to be.

Seventh article of the Circular is reserved to the issue of gender equality in the scope of in-service trainings. However, other than the exceptional provinces mentioned above, these trainings are conducted a way different from the plan and without a gender perspective.

Serious problems have been noticed about the establishment and agendas of the Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards (İİMEK) that takes place in the article 8 of the Prime Ministerial Circular. First, the Circular does not

CONCLUSION

clarify how to establish the equality. Second, the Circular does not clarify the position of the participant women's NGO representative in İİMEK; it is uncertain whether this representative would be an observer or a board member. In the research provinces, it has been observed that in most of the cases woman representative does not attend the İİMEK meeting and when she does she participates as an observer. İİMEKs commonly accept women's NGOs of the province having "entrepreneur", "business woman" adjectives in their title, as member women's organizations. Governor's and local administrator's initiative power to determine about the woman's organization that is going to participate in İİMEK is another significant exclusive practice.

It has been observed that the ninth article of the Circular was not put in practice either. Article 9 suggests "focusing on the prominent sectors in vocation trainings which are most relevant for women's employment", reporting the activities on the subject and submitting the reports to the National Monitoring and Coordination Board. However, it is obvious that the Circular statement on arranging the vocational trainings in coherence with the leading sectors in terms women's employment is a discourse and implication which reproduces the traditional gender roles. Moreover, since the trainings are established on project basis, they are temporary.

Article 10 suggests the establishment of the arrangements about vocational trainings in accordance with "equal opportunity for women and men" policies. However, this suggestion also fails to be realized since "gender equality" trainings are transformed into women's health and family trainings in practice.

Within the projects on the employment of the "most disadvantaged women" as it was stated in the article 11 of the Circular, no endeavor has been observed other than vocational trainings. Again, even if the mentioned projects are employment-guaranteed, this employment fails to be permanent.

It is recommended to collect systematic data in gender basis in article 12 of the Prime Ministerial Circular. Although we were not able to reach province level data, there are some significant improvements on this issue. However, it has been observed that home-based works -with few exceptional studies- are commonly ignored.

The arrangements about childcare centers referred in the thirteenth article of the Circular, set out by the protocol on Organized Industrial Zones and Labour Law numbered 4875 are not put in practice. Childcare and day care centers are among the major necessities for increasing women's employment. The high costs of the private childcare centers cause women's withdrawal from the work life. The childcare supports provided by the employers are insufficient and problematic.

In terms of the research we have also reached some significant outcomes which were not mentioned in the Circular. Women have difficulty at finding jobs even if they got a number of vocational trainings and they have a lot of certificates. Women intensively attend to the vocational trainings; but these trainings do not create employment. The reasons of this situation are discussed in the mid-term assessment report.¹⁶

Moreover for women who got vocation trainings, major problem starts after the training ends. In general women cannot work at the same job for a long time. There is a need for a research on this subject. Nevertheless it must be noted here that although there is need for a research, vocational training projects have a potential to improve the circulation of women's labour between firms.

Within the scope of the research, we reach particular findings about the direction of women's employment follows in 12 provinces. In this mid-term assessment report these findings are not included. However the final report will include detailed information, demographic and economic data about each province, besides the provincial tendencies on employment.

Another dimension of the research is the assessment of previous suggestions that the KEIG Platform had published (See Appendix 2). The set of suggestions which were also influential during the preparation of the Circular will be assessed and improved.

We were able to develop the suggestions below through the findings of this mid-term assessment. As KEIG Platform members, we will be making the following suggestions in the political processes that we participate in 12 provinces.

16 *The reasons can be summarized as: Employers include the necessary conditions for women's employment (childcare center, nursing room, and transportation service) to the cost of employment; and offer low wages to women. Women do not accept these jobs because when they consider the cost of care services, food and transportation expenses, their expenditure seems to be higher than the wage that is offered to them. Another factor is those employers do not employ women for skill-needed jobs and in the areas with high value-added taxes. There are factors causing women's withdrawal from the vocational trainings too. The long period of trainings, not arranging the time and place of the training in accordance with women's conditions and preferences, women's emotional despair about finding a job etc.*

SUGGESTIONS

1. Current problems about women's employment must be determined; the works which aim to diminish these problems must be monitored and assessed. The National Monitoring and Coordination Committee for Women's Employment which was established to enable coordination and collaboration must acquire an efficient structure. In this sense the Committee must be transformed into a more institutional establishment.

2. Vocational trainings for women must be arranged in accordance with the provincial labour force needs analyses and with a perspective aiming to abrade the perceptions on woman job/man job.

3. Public and other institutions must locate gender equality perspective within their in-service trainings.

4. Since care works are among the most significant obstacles before women's employment, the necessary works in order to transfer care responsibilities from women to public institutions, should be carried out immediately. Therefore the number of childcare, day care, patient/elderly/disabled care centers linked to the central and local administrations must be increased. All the women and men should be able to benefit from this support equally as a "social right".

5. Provincial data must be collected about the home-based working women. The work conditions and relations should be re-arranged according to the suggestions of the Home-Based Working Women Group which is also the member of KEIG Platform.

6. "Commissions for the Equality of Women and Men" should be established in all the provinces with the participation of the governor, local administration officials and all the related actors. These commissions should have autonomous budgets, sanction power and independent statuses. And all the women organizations and groups should attend to these commissions regardless of their formal statuses.

7. The projects implemented at both local and national levels -especially based on EU funds- which aim to empower women, to increase women's employment, and to establish gender equality should not be limited only to trainings and capacity building programmes. The implementation of the actions should also consider sustainability and regular monitorings should be adopted causing a transformation in women's daily life experiences.

REFERENCE

12 Provinces' employment and vocational training board activity report 2010-2011-2012

12 Provinces' provincial labour force needs analysis reports

12 Provinces' Chambers of Trade and Industry reports and publications

12 Provinces' local web sites publications, newspaper and journal review

12 Provinces' strategic plans, activity reports and performance program assessments (by local administration and public institutions)

12 Provinces' development agency reports (regional plans and current state analyses include)

BETAM bulletins

Boğaziçi Üniversitesi Sosyal Politika Forumu (2009), Türkiye'de Çocuk Bakım Hizmetlerinin Yaygınlaştırılmasına Yönelik Bir Öneri (A Proposal for Wide-spreading Child Care Services in Turkey).

Contemporary Researches on Women's Labour

Dedeoğlu, Saniye (2009)

Eşitlik mi Ayrımcılık mı, Türkiye'de Sosyal Devlet, Cinsiyet Eşitliği Politikaları ve Kadın İstihdamı (Equality or Discrimination, Social State Gender Equality Policies and Women Employment in Turkey), Çalışma ve Toplum, 2009/2:41-54.

<http://www.kadininstatusu.gov.tr/tr/html/138/Gebe+veya+Emziren+Kadınların+Ca+listirilme+Sartlarıyla+Emzirme+Odalari+ve+Cocuk+Bakim+Yurtlarına+Dair+Yon+etmelik>

<http://www.kadininstatusu.gov.tr/tr/html/266/Imzalanana+Protokoller>

http://www.kadininstatusu.gov.tr/upload/mce/2012/uep_2011.pdf

http://www.kadininstatusu.gov.tr/upload/mce/aile_bilimsanayi.pdf

<http://www.sanayigazetesi.com.tr/kadinin-is-yasamindaki-kolayligi-makale,219.html>

KSGM (2012), Türkiye'de Kadının Durumu (Situation of Women in Turkey), T.C. Aile ve Sosyal Politikalar Bakanlığı Kadın Statüsü Genel Müdürlüğü Raporu, Ankara

TEPAV Employment Watch Bulletins

Toksöz, Gülay (2007) Türkiye'de Kadın İstihdam Durumu Raporu (Report on State of Women Employment in Turkey), ILO, Ankara

TÜİK (2011) İl Düzeyinde Temel İşgücü Göstergeleri (Basic Labor Indicators at City Level), T.C. Başbakanlık Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu, Sayı: 8536, Ankara

TÜİK (2012) Hane halkı İşgücü İstatistikleri (Household Labor Indicators), Temmuz 2012, T.C. Başbakanlık Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu, Sayı: 10920, Ankara

APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1:

Prime Ministerial Circular No. 2010/4: Increasing Women's Employment and Achieving Equal Opportunity

1. National Monitoring and Coordination Committee for Women's Employment will be established in order to determine the current problems about women's employment and monitor all the works conducted by all related parties while enabling the coordination and collaboration between them.

2. A deputy undersecretary will be assigned to each Ministry in order to monitor the implementation of the laws, regulations, and arrangements about the equal opportunity regarding the women's employment in public sector. Also a department will be charged with the tasks about the equality of women and men in every Ministry.

3. In every public and private sector inspection, an assessment about whether the regulations the Labour Law No.4857 set out was put into practice or not will be included in the inspection report.

4. State institutions and organizations and local administrations will include gender perspective in their strategic plans, activity reports, and performance programs. Statistical data, scientific researches, and the necessary budget for these will be included in these texts.

5. State institutions will make equal opportunity impact assessment and present it in the appendix while preparing the legislative drafts.

6. In state institutions and organizations during the processes of job examinations, attendance to in-service trainings, promotion to senior management positions, the principle of equality of opportunity for women and men will be followed and discrimination against women will not be allowed.

7. All state institutions and organizations will include the issue of "equality of opportunity for women and men" into their in-service training programs.

8. The Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards will promote equality of opportunity for women and men; and a representative from one of the NGOs working on "women" will participate in these boards.

9. The Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards will focus on the vocational trainings for leading sectors regarding women's employment. In every January reports concerning the activities and outcomes will be sent to the National Monitoring and Coordination Committee for Women's Employment.

10. All the formal education activities and vocational training programs conducted by Public Education Centers, Community Centers, Directorate-General of the Turkish Employment Agency, and local administrations will be planned with the collaboration of NGOs and will include topics concerning women's human rights, train-

ing and employment options, counseling and guiding during job-seeking.

11. Projects about the social participation of women who were subjected to violence and stay in women shelters, women who are in prison and will be released in less than a year, women whose husbands were died and divorced women will be given priority.

12. Statistics concerning the work life will be collected and made in gender basis. Also extra statistics will be collected and researches will be conducted about home-based working women.

13. Child care and day care center obligation for the public and private workplaces that was set out by the Labour Law numbered 4875 will be fulfilled and inspected.

APPENDIX 2: Projects and Protocols on Women's Employment

***Directorate-General of Turkish Employment Agency signed a protocol with Directorate- General of Family and Social Services (ATHGM) in scope of the Operation of Support for Women's Employment.** The protocol aims to support the solution of the problems that women face while getting involve in the labour market. In order to contribute to women's economic and social empowerment, the Protocol aims developing "Guidance Networks" in 5 pilot provinces which will provide integral presentation of the collaboration of services.

Çorum, Erzurum, Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa and Trabzon are among the pilot provinces. Through the Guidance Network the services of the İŞKUR (Turkish Employment Agency) and ATGHM (Directorate-General of Family and Social Services) are planned to be integrally presented through a network after determining the personal problems women encounter while getting into the labour market and defining the ones among these which could be improved for their employability.

***The cooperation protocol between the Ministry of Family and Social Policies and the Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology on developing entrepreneurship activities for women, the disabled, veterans' and martyrs' relatives and increasing women's employment was signed on 10th February 2012.** Strategies for supporting women's entrepreneurship was determined; in addition to this, within the scope of reconciliation of work and family life measures, it was planned to promote and enable the necessary conditions for the establishment of childcare centers in Organized Industrial Zones where women can leave their children while working.

***The cooperation protocol between the Ministry of Family and Social Policies and the Ministry of Labour and Social Security on employment, child labour and social aid was signed on 17th February 2012.** The protocol involves significant provisions which can contribute to participation of women in the economic life such

APPENDICES

as reconciliation of the work and family life, and related to this increasing and improving childcare services; integrating topics such as gender equality, women's human rights, social rights concerning work life, preventing violence against women, family education into training modules of the labour training courses implemented by Turkish Employment Agency; working on the improvement of work and life conditions of seasonal worker women in agriculture sector; providing access to Turkish Employment Agency for women who were subjected to violence and stay in women shelters, women who are in prison and will be released in less than a year, women whose husbands were died and divorced women.

*Turkey's efforts to get involve in EU employment strategy also became a driving force for increasing women employment. As it is known, one of the 4 dimensions of the Europe Employment Strategy is establishing the equality between women and men. The Ministry of Labour and Social Security maintains its efforts to get involve in EU Employment Strategy. In this context, "**Employment Situation Report**" was prepared and women's positions in labour market were analyzed in this report. Works on **Joint Evaluation Document** continue. In addition to this, the draft text of the National Employment Strategy Document was prepared; and with regards to the determined target of the document on increasing women participation to labour market the aim is raising the women's labour force participation rate to the level of 35 percent until 2023.

***Operation of Supporting Women's Employment** was carried out in the growth centers in NUTS II regions between June and December 2011 for increasing women's employability; easing their process of getting job; minimizing the obstacles before their participation in labour force; and particularly enabling public employment services of İŞKUR to be more effective in the local scale. The mentioned Operation aims to provide better services for women who want to enter into labour market; to increase women employability through vocational, social empowerment, consultancy and entrepreneurship trainings; improving child/elderly care services, to raise awareness and sensitiveness on the struggle with the cultural obstacles that prevent women's participation in labour force.

Many women benefited from İŞKUR's entrepreneurship and employment guaranteed labour training courses, vocation and job consultancy services. Mentioned services still continue.

*"**Improvement of Gender Equality in Work Life Project**" was carried out by **Labour and Social Security Ministry's Directorate-General of Labour between September 2010 and March 2012 period**. Within the scope of the project, the legislation was analyzed in detail by twinning experts, by paying attention to the instructions on gender equality in work life and ATAD decisions. In this context, inconsistencies between Labour Law No. 4857, State Personnel Law No.657, Social Security and General Health Security Law No.5510, second arrangements concerning these laws and EU legislation were determined. Moreover, skilled staff and inspectors of the Ministry of Labour and Social Security were given trainings on labour legislation from gender equality perspective.

*Various works and studies were carried out by The Confederation of Turkish Tradesmen and Craftsmen (TESK), Small and Medium Enterprises Development Organization (KOSGEB) and women NGOs in order to increase women's participation in labour force.

-Business Incubators for Women Entrepreneurs (KİŞGEM) were established in İstanbul (Pendik), Nevşehir (Hacıbektaş), Kütahya and Çorum within the scope of **Small and Medium Enterprises Development Organization's (KOSGEB) "Project of Supporting Women's Entrepreneurship through Job Centers"**; and start-up support is given to women who want to start their own businesses in the mentioned job centers.

-In this context, **"The Cooperation Protocol for Applied Entrepreneurship Training (UGEP)"** was signed between **Turkish Employment Organization (İŞKUR) and Small and Medium Enterprises Development Organization (KOSGEB) on 18th September 2009**. The targets of the Protocol include giving entrepreneurship training to 10.000 persons –of which an important sum will be women- and enabling 30 percent of participants participate in the employment by starting their own businesses. Also in order to achieve the integration of the citizens who are socio-economically in poverty into the society by fulfilling their social needs and enabling them to achieve sustainable income and thus an active/productive position in economy, the Directorate-General of Social Aids provides income-generating project supports for starting business in urban areas and accessing sustainable activities suitable to local conditions in rural areas.

***The Board of Women Entrepreneurs was founded by the Turkish Union of Chambers and Exchange Commodities (TOBB)** in order to determine policies to improve quantity and quality of the women entrepreneur potential in Turkey. Our Directorate-General is also a member of the mentioned board. The board which is organized in 81 provinces carries out works for determining policies in order to improve the quantity and quality of the women entrepreneur potential while rendering it more equipped and leading the improvement of entrepreneurship culture among women.

***In Public Education Centers linked to the Ministry of National Education**, vocational trainings are given to women and young girls who are the most disadvantaged groups in society in terms of participation to labour market in order to increase their participation to economic and social life.

-The women and young girls who get the training in one of the 131 fields of profession within the scope of the Law in Vocational Training Centers, after getting apprenticeship and mastership certificates, either start their own businesses or work in various sectors as qualified intermediate labour force.

-The Project of Training Centers for Mothers and Fathers is carried out by **Directorate-General of Life Long Learning linked to the Ministry of National Education**. The project aims to helping the determination of secondary school girls'

APPENDICES

vocations in accordance with their interests and abilities and sustainability of their education by the support of their families.

-Social Support Program (SODES) was constituted between 2008 and 2011 as a component of the South Eastern Anatolia Project (GAP) Action Plan's "Providing Social Development" topic. Women are among the prior target groups of the Social Support Program (SODES) which aims to provide social solidarity and coalescence by improving the life quality.

*There are regional plans that are put into practice due to the underdevelopment of some regions in Turkey. In this context, GAP (South Eastern Anatolia Project) for South Eastern Anatolia Region, DAP (Eastern Anatolia Project) for Eastern Anatolia Region and DOKAP (Eastern Black Sea Project) for Eastern Black Sea Region are enforced. Within the scope of the mentioned projects, through the coordination of Governorships projects which aim the empowerment of the NGOs working for women and public are being carried out.

*As a result of the obstacles women encounter while participating in the labour force and the gender inequality in the division of economic power, women get poorer and the millstone around their neck get heavier especially in woman-led households. Therefore as it is seen in world examples and also in the examples from Turkey, it is needed to extend credit implementations and provide women entrepreneurs the training, consultancy, guidance and funding that they look for.

In this context, micro-credit studies are being carried out in Turkey in order to prevent poverty. In item (a) of the sixth article of the Provincial Special Administration Law, providing micro-credit for the poor is included among the duties and authorities of the Provincial Special Administration. Therefore Directorate-General on the Status of Woman sent a document to the Ministry of Interior Relations and suggested that if the mentioned article is implemented through an affirmative action perspective, and the Governorships of the 81 provinces put the regulation into practice with the aim of decreasing women's poverty it would be an important contribution for empowering women economically, improving women's self-confidence and self-respect and preventing violence against women. In some provinces micro-credit endeavors were started after the Ministry of Interior Relations sent Governorships related instructions.

*In 2012 "**Empowerment of the Women in Rural Area Action Plan**" will be prepared by the Ministry of Food, Agriculture, and Livestock in cooperation with state institutions and organizations, NGOs, universities, regional development institutions and organizations and international financial institutions within the scope of 5 year progress plan. "Women Farmers Agricultural Extension Project" is carried out by the Ministry of Food, Agriculture, and Livestock in order to train women living in rural areas on agricultural issues and empower women's economic and social position in rural areas.

APPENDIX 3: Women's Labour and Employment in Turkey: Problem Areas and Policy Suggestions (KEİG Report, 2009)

<http://www.keig.org/yayinlar/keig%20platformu%20politika%20raporu.pdf>

APPENDIX 4: Tables and Charts

Table 1: The State of Labour Force and Employment of the Population Aged 15 and above, Turkey (2011)

Years	Woman					Man				
	Non-institutional working age population (000)	Labour Force (000)	Labour Force Participation Rate (%)	Employed (000)	Employment Rate (%)	Non-institutional working age population (000)	Labour Force (000)	Labour Force Participation Rate (%)	Employed (000)	Employment Rate (%)
1990	18,045	6,160	34,1	5,637	31,2	17,556	13,990	79,7	12,901	73,5
1995	20,787	6,427	30,9	5,958	28,7	20,388	15,858	77,8	14,628	71,7
2000	23,295	6,188	26,6	5,801	24,9	22,916	16,890	73,7	15,780	68,9
2001	23,769	6,451	27,1	5,969	25,1	23,389	17,040	72,9	15,555	66,5
2002	24,214	6,760	27,9	6,122	25,3	23,827	17,058	71,6	15,232	63,9
2003	24,652	6,555	26,6	5,891	23,9	24,260	17,086	70,4	15,256	62,9
2004	24,293	5,669	23,3	5,047	20,8	23,251	16,348	70,3	14,585	62,7
2005	24,686	5,750	23,3	5,108	20,7	23,673	16,704	70,6	14,959	63,2
2006	25,080	5,916	23,6	5,258	21,0	24,094	16,836	69,9	15,165	62,9
2007	25,480	6,016	23,6	5,356	21,0	24,513	17,098	69,8	15,382	62,7
2008	25,855	6,329	24,5	5,595	21,6	24,917	17,476	70,1	15,598	62,6
2009	26,317	6,851	26,0	5,871	22,3	25,369	17,898	70,5	15,406	60,7
2010	26,740	7,383	27,6	6,425	24,0	25,801	18,257	70,8	16,170	62,7
2011	27,273	7,859	28,8	6,973	25,6	26,320	18,867	71,7	17,137	65,1

Resource: TÜİK, Household Labour Force Survey, 2012

APPENDICES

Table 2: The State of Labour Force and Employment of the Population Aged 15 and above, Urban Area (2011)

Years	WOMAN					MAN				
	Non-institutional working age population (000)	Labour Force (000)	Labour Force Participation Rate (%)	Employed (000)	Employment Rate (%)	Non-institutional working age population (000)	Labour Force (000)	Labour Force Participation Rate (%)	Employed (000)	Employment Rate (%)
2004	17,125	3,039	17,7	2,495	14,6	16,548	11,432	69,1	10,006	60,5
2005	17,263	3,236	18,7	2,685	15,6	16,875	11,811	70,0	10,441	61,9
2006	17,510	3,413	19,5	2,853	16,3	17,277	11,978	69,3	10,666	61,7
2007	17,770	3,513	19,8	2,947	16,6	17,504	12,122	69,3	10,817	61,8
2008	17,976	3,739	20,8	3,117	17,3	17,721	12,323	69,5	10,892	61,5
2009	18,321	4,084	22,3	3,252	17,7	17,875	12,501	69,9	10,587	57,5
2010	18,519	4,396	23,7	3,575	19,3	18,057	12,709	70,4	11,104	59,2
2011	18,736	4,655	24,8	3,885	20,7	18,236	12,939	71,0	11,623	61,5

Table 3: The State of Labour Force and Employment of the Population Aged 15 and above, Rural Area (2011)

Years	WOMAN					MAN				
	Non-institutional working age population (000)	Labour Force (000)	Labour Force Participation Rate (%)	Employed (000)	Employment Rate (%)	Non-institutional working age population (000)	Labour Force (000)	Labour Force Participation Rate (%)	Employed (000)	Employment Rate (%)
2004	7,168	2,629	36,7	2,552	35,6	6,703	4,916	73,3	4,579	68,3
2005	7,422	2,514	33,9	2,423	32,6	6,798	4,894	72,0	4,518	66,5
2006	7,570	2,503	33,1	2,405	31,8	6,817	4,857	71,3	4,500	66,0
2007	7,710	2,503	32,5	2,409	31,2	7,009	4,976	71,0	4,565	65,1
2008	7,879	2,509	32,9	2,478	31,4	7,195	5,153	71,6	4,706	65,4
2009	7,996	2,766	34,6	2,619	32,8	7,493	5,396	72,0	4,819	64,3
2010	8,221	2,987	36,3	2,850	34,7	7,744	5,549	71,6	5,065	65,4
2011	8,536	3,203	37,5	3,088	36,2	8,084	5,928	73,3	5,514	68,2

Source: TÜİK Household Labour Force Survey 2012

Table 4: Labour Force According to the Statistical Territorial Units (2011) (15+age)

İBBS-SRE	TOTAL			WOMAN			MAN		
	Labour Force Participation (%)	Unemployment Rate (%)	Employment Rate (%)	Labour Force Participation (%)	Unemployment Rate (%)	Employment Rate (%)	Labour Force Participation (%)	Unemployment Rate (%)	Employment Rate (%)
Toplam	49,9	9,8	45,0	28,8	11,3	25,6	71,7	9,2	65,1
İstanbul	48,8	11,8	43,1	25,2	15,2	21,4	72,7	10,6	65,0
Western Marmara	51,2	7,1	47,5	31,5	10,2	28,3	71,2	5,8	67,1
Aegean	53,5	10,0	48,1	34,9	13,3	30,3	72,8	8,4	66,7
Eastern Marmara	51,5	9,8	46,5	30,6	13,0	26,7	72,7	8,4	66,6
Western Anatolia	48,1	8,6	44,0	25,9	11,2	23,1	71,3	7,6	65,8
Mediterranean	52,9	10,6	47,3	33,2	12,0	29,2	73,6	10,0	66,3
Central Anatolia	48,6	9,7	43,9	27,1	10,5	24,2	71,1	9,3	64,4
Western Black Sea	54,7	6,0	51,4	39,5	6,5	36,9	70,9	5,6	66,9
Eastern Black Sea	57,4	6,4	53,7	44,0	4,7	41,9	71,4	7,5	66,1
North-eastern Anatolia	52,4	8,3	48,1	30,2	3,3	29,2	74,7	10,4	66,9
Middle-eastern Anatolia	47,7	11,2	42,4	24,0	9,4	21,8	72,5	11,8	63,9
South-eastern Anatolia	36,3	11,7	32,1	10,0	9,1	9,1	64,4	12,1	56,6

Source: TÜİK, Household Labour Force Survey, 2012

Table 5: Women's Labour Force According to the Position and Formality at Work, 2011 (1000 persons)

Waged or Paid	%	Employer	%	Self-employed	%	Unwaged Family Worker	%	Total	
MAN									
Unregistered	2.794	46	258	4	2.345	38	712	12	6.109
Registered	8.483	77	899	8	1.526	14	120	1	11.028
Total	11.277	66	1.157	7	3.871	23	832	5	17.137
Informality Rate		70		22		61		86	36
WOMAN									
Unregistered	945	23	20	0	731	18	2.334	58	4.030
Registered	2.653	90	67	2	85	3	138	5	2.943
Total	3.599	52	87	1	816	12	2.472	35	6.973
Informality Rate		26		23		90		94	58

Source: TÜİK, Labour Force Statistics Database

APPENDICES

Tablo 6: REASONS OF NOT BEING IN LABOUR FORCE BY YEARS AND SEX
(SRE, Level 2)

(Thousand person, 15+ age)

TURKEY

Years	REASON								
	Population not in labour force	Not seeking a job, but available to start		Working seasonally	Housewife	Education / Training	Retired	Disabled, old ill etc.	Other
		Discouraged	Other						
FEMALE									
2011 – ANNUAL	19,414	271	821	50	11,872	2,043	772	2,174	1,410
TR10 (<i>İstanbul</i>)	3,673	7	61	2	2,224	406	223	225	526
TR21 (<i>Tekirdağ, Edirne, Kırklareli</i>)	409	16	30	1	153	31	16	81	80
TR22 (<i>Balıkesir, Çanakkale</i>)	470	9	44	-	287	36	23	60	10
TR31 (<i>İzmir</i>)	1,045	8	60	1	564	107	122	103	79
TR32 (<i>Aydın, Denizli, Muğla</i>)	696	16	51	6	352	68	41	126	36
TR33 (<i>Manisa, Afyon, Kütahya, Uşak</i>)	719	6	9	10	498	66	18	97	16
TR41 (<i>Bursa, Eskişehir, Bilecik</i>)	1,005	1	9	6	743	98	61	73	15
TR42 (<i>Kocaeli, Sakarya, Düzce, Bolu, Yalova</i>)	832	3	16	7	582	95	29	75	27
TR51 (<i>Ankara</i>)	1,363	3	32	2	990	165	92	60	19
TR52 (<i>Konya, Karaman</i>)	601	15	66	-	266	58	5	103	88
TR61 (<i>Antalya, Isparta, Burdur</i>)	597	15	44	4	241	59	26	138	71
TR62 (<i>Adana, Mersin</i>)	936	35	89	1	388	99	27	149	149
TR63 (<i>Hatay, Kahramanmaraş, Osmaniye</i>)	758	32	57	1	351	78	11	119	108
TR71 (<i>Kırıkkale, Aksaray, Niğde, Nevşehir, Kırşehir</i>)	434	1	8	-	323	47	6	46	3
TR72 (<i>Kayseri, Sivas, Yozgat</i>)	598	14	20	-	411	62	7	63	20
TR81 (<i>Zonguldak, Karabük, Bartın</i>)	231	2	10	-	136	23	6	37	16
TR82 (<i>Kastamonu, Çankırı, Sinop</i>)	161	7	9	-	48	15	5	48	29
TR83 (<i>Samsun, Tokat, Çorum, Amasya</i>)	660	5	24	2	389	81	24	116	19
TR90 (<i>Trabzon, Ordu, Giresun, Rize, Artvin, Gümüşhane</i>)	554	6	17	2	278	74	15	148	12
TRA1 (<i>Erzurum, Erzincan, Bayburt</i>)	247	3	9	1	156	27	1	38	12
TRA2 (<i>Ağrı, Kars, Iğdır, Ardahan</i>)	239	1	5	-	166	34	1	30	2
TRB1 (<i>Malatya, Elazığ, Bingöl, Tunceli</i>)	461	15	49	1	276	55	4	51	9
TRB2 (<i>Van, Muş, Bitlis, Hakkari</i>)	471	17	50	-	276	38	1	46	43
TRC1 (<i>Gaziantep, Adıyaman, Kilis</i>)	698	1	7	1	567	65	5	48	4
TRC2 (<i>Şanlıurfa, Diyarbakır</i>)	964	7	13	1	781	104	2	47	9
TRC3 (<i>Mardin, Batman, Şırnak, Siirt</i>)	590	26	31	-	426	52	-	46	9

APPENDIX 5: Questions

“THE RESEARCH ON THE STATE OF WOMEN’S EMPLOYMENT IN TURKEY AFTER THE PRIME MINISTERIAL CIRCULAR 2010/14” INTERVIEW FORM

1. Can you tell us the activities on employment you have carried out in the province until today?

2. Questions relying on the Circular:

a. Did you pay attention to gender equality in the strategic plan, performance program, and the activity report that you have prepared? In which areas did you pay attention? How? Can you tell us?

b. Do these documents involve data and statistics categorized on gender basis?

c. While preparing the legislative drafts was the impact assessment on gender equality done? Do you perform it?

d. Can you say that in your institution the principle of equality of opportunity for women and men is followed during the processes of job examinations, attendance to in-service trainings, promotion, assignment to senior-management? How do these processes operate in your institution?

e. Does the topic of equality of women and men take place in your in-service trainings?

f. Did the Provincial Employment and Vocational Education Boards conduct provincial labour market analysis? Which sectors come to the forefront? Are there vocational trainings for these sectors? Are they employment guaranteed? Which vocational trainings are given for women’s employment? Instead of increasing women’s employment in these sectors, why it was preferred to give vocational trainings in other sectors? Are the reports on the issue written through a gender perspective? Can we reach those reports?

g. Do vocational trainings include topics such as woman’s human rights, training and employment options, counseling and guidance during job-seeking?

h. Do you perform regular work about the home-based working women? Do you collect data and statistics about this issue?

i. Did the processes of establishing child and day care centers speed up after the Circular? How is the situation in Organized Industrial Zones and other places? What is the general state in the province/region?

3. We have observed that some regulations that the Circular set out was not put into practice. What do you think is the reason for this situation? Are there any factors which limited the necessary work? Can you explain these?

